MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D.C.

23 April 1969

INDEX

	Page
ADMINISTRATION	
1. Date of Next Meeting	1
2. Approval of Minutes of March Meeting	1
3. Nominations for Appointment to the Old Georgetown Board	1
4. Lighting of the Lincoln Memorial	1-2
SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS	
1. Department of the Army Robert F. Kennedy Grave Site, Arlington Natl Cem.	2
2. D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency	
a. Parcels 19 and 20	2
b. Town Center Park	2
c. L'Enfant Plaza, East Building	3
3. D.C. Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds Fort Lincoln School	3
4. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development	
a. S.L. 69-45, 1400 22nd St., N.W.	3-4
b. Appendix 1	4
Old Georgetown Act	
a. O.G. 69-130, 1665 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.	4
b. O.G. 69-131, 1667 Wisconsin Ave., N.W.	4
LEGISLATION	
1. H.J. Res. 599	4

2. H.R.262, H.R. 2191, H.R. 2194, H.R. 2386 4-5

3. Draft Legislation, National Armed Forces Historical Museum Park and Study Center 5

INTERVIEWS

1. Department of the Army - Robert F. Kennedy Grave Site 5

2. D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency

   a. Parcels 19 and 20 5

   b. Center Town Center Park 5

3. D.C. Government, Dept. of Buildings and Grounds

   Fort Lincoln School 6

4. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

   S.L. 69-45, 1400 22nd St., N.W. 6

5. Composition of the Mall 6-7

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS
HELD IN WASHINGTON, D.C.

I. CONVENE, ROOM 7000, INTERIOR DEPARTMENT BUILDING

A regular monthly meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts was held in its office in the Interior Department Building on 23 April 1969. The members met, pursuant to notice, in executive session at 10:20 a.m. with William Walton, Chairman, presiding.

Present were: William Walton
Gordon Bunshaft
Kevin Roche
Aline Saarinen
Chloethiel Woodard Smith

Staff: Charles H. Atherton, Secretary
M. Lawrence Luskey
Nancee W. Black
Myra Younker

Recorder: Mary Ann Coffey

II. ADMINISTRATION

1. Date of Next Meeting

The members approved Wednesday, 21 May 1969, as the date for the next meeting. Thursday, 19 June 1969, was tentatively selected for the following month.

2. Approval of Minutes of March Meeting

The minutes of the March meeting were approved.

3. Nominations for Appointment to the Old Georgetown Board

(Wynant D. Vanderpool, Jr., G. Revell Michael, Jr.)

The members unanimously approved the appointment of Wynant D. Vanderpool who was recommended by the Secretary to fill the vacancy on the Old Georgetown Board caused by the resignation of Frank Cole.

4. Lighting of the Lincoln Memorial (Added)

Mr. Walton reported that he and Mrs. Smith, had met with officials of the National Park Service to adjust the settings of illumination for the Lincoln Memorial. The intensity was diminished as the Commission had requested. They recommended that baffles be constructed to conceal the source of light near the corners of the soffit and that some form of lighting for the steps be considered.

The Commission's recommendations were forwarded to the National Park Service. EXHIBIT A

III. SUBMISSIONS-REVIEWS

The Secretary presented and reviewed the following projects.

1. Department of the Army

Robert F. Kennedy Grave Site, Arlington National Cemetery - Revised Design, I.M. Pei, architect.

As a member of a Sub-Committee with Mr. Roche, Mr. Bunshaft reported on the conference with Mr. Pei on the design of the Robert F. Kennedy Grave. The plan was reduced in scale and the trees regrouped around the site, separating it from the grave of President Kennedy. The geometry of the new design was also better related to the President's grave. Although some of the members felt the paved area too large, thus diminishing the wooded setting, they agreed that its size was essential to accommodate the crowds. Considering the plan a much improved solution which met the requirements of the family and the Department of the Army, the members unanimously approved the design. A conference with the architect was cancelled.

The Commission's approval was reported to the General Counsel of the Army, Mr. Jordan. EXHIBIT B

2. D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency

a. Parcels 19 and 20, Maryland Avenue between 6th and 7th Sts., S.W. - Revised Design. Caudill, Rowlett and Scott, and Venturi and Rauch, associated architects.

Changes in the design included recessed windows which related to the structural system and gave some relief to the facade. The "loggia" feature at the main entrance had been eliminated. The members felt the design had been improved and approved it. A conference with the architect was considered unnecessary and was cancelled.

The Commission's approval was forwarded to the Redevelopment Land Agency. EXHIBIT C

b. Town Center Park, Eye Street between 3rd and 6th Streets, S.W. Revised Design. Wallace, McHarg, Roberts and Todd, landscape architects.

The members thought the concept of a town center or village square was appropriate for the area but the revised design did not reflect that idea. It was far too complicated and did not relate to the surrounding

area particularly well.

Action was withheld until a conference with the architect.

c. L'Enfant Plaza, East Building, 10th Street, S.W. - Revised Design, Vlastimil Koubek, architect.

The model and drawings reflected Pei's original design but did not copy it. The hotel area consisted of two floors at the top rather than three and the cornice line "stepped up" from the West Building was considered an improvement, both in the scale and proportion of the facades. The members unanimously approved the revised design. A conference with the architect was considered unnecessary and cancelled.

The Commission's approval was forwarded to the Redevelopment Land Agency. EXHIBIT C

3. D.C. Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds

Fort Lincoln School - Proposed Design, Fry and Welch, architects.

The model and drawings indicated a radical change from established school plans. Consisting of large open learning spaces, rather than conventional classrooms, the plan had few permanent partitions, a requirement of the school board's newest teaching program. The architect had coordinated the plans with the school board members, teachers and community leaders as well as a professional educational consulting firm. The building would also serve as a community center, with facilities for recreation, adult education, etc.

The members felt the plan was too complicated and the design had too many motifs. They briefly discussed the fact that buildings with multi-use programs can and should be simple and strong in architectural concept. They thought that a better understanding of the limitations of the program would help in arriving at a better design.

Mr. Walton remarked that Fort Lincoln should become an outstanding community esthetically. The Commission should guide the architect and direct the community leaders in their efforts to establish the best for this "new town." Such attempts will be difficult but will serve as the Commission's contribution to the proposed model city.

Further discussion was withheld until a conference with the architect.

4. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

Shipstead-Luce Act

a. S.L. 69-45, 1400 22nd St., N.W., Proposed Office Building.

The Perkins and Wills Partnership, architects.

The members approved the design which had been revised as they had recommended. The design for the precast concrete building now clearly reflected the structural system by having the columns exposed rather than recessed three feet back of the facade. Exterior materials will be reviewed later.

The Commission's approval was reported to the Department of Economic Development.

b. Appendix 1

There were no objections to the recommendations by the staff on the Shipstead-Luce Applications listed on Appendix 1. EXHIBIT D

Old Georgetown Act

a. O.G. 69-130, 1665 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. - Raze

b. O.G. 69-131, 1667 Wisconsin Ave., N.W. - Raze

The above structures were considered as one. Although thought to be of no particular historic or architectural value there was still some doubt as to whether the buildings should be razed as proposed. No scheme or plan had been developed to replace them. To preserve the cityscape they were considered worth saving if structurally feasible.

The members agreed that both buildings should be retained in any event until a plan for a replacement is available for review.

The D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development, was informed of the Commission's disapproval of the permit to raze.

IV. LEGISLATION

1. H.J.Res. 599-3/25/69-Mr. Roybal-91st C

To provide for the establishment of a fitting memorial in the Nation's Capital to the American space program and to the brave and dedicated individuals who carry it forward. EXHIBIT E

The Commission had no objection to the enactment of the proposed resolution provided the design is submitted to the Commission for review.

The Committee on House Administration was so informed.

2. H.R. 262, H.R. 2191, H.R. 2194, H.R. 2386 - Budget Bureau - 91st C

D.C. Parking Bills EXHIBIT F

Although the above bills had much in common, they conflicted with previous legislation introduced by Senator Tydings which would establish a public parking agency with powers of condemnation. The Commission had previously supported Senator Tydings' proposal. Introduced by Mr. McMillan, H.R. 262 permitted an increase in the height of buildings to 230 feet.

The members accepted the Secretary's recommendation to take no action at the present time but wait until the bills had been thoroughly explored in public hearings.

3. Draft Legislation-Bureau of the Budget-91st Congress (Added)

Smithsonian Institution draft bill "To establish a National Armed Forces Historical Museum Park and Study Center." EXHIBIT G

Mr. Walton commented that the Commission should favor such legislation which would establish a museum park and study center in adjacent outlying areas of Fort Foote and Fort Washington. This would prevent a concentration of such facilities within the Nation's Capital and specifically in the vicinity of the Mall. The members approved the proposed legislation.

The Bureau of the Budget was informed.

V. INTERVIEWS

1. Department of the Army

Robert F. Kennedy Grave Site, Arlington National Cemetery - Revised Design. Cancelled.

2. D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency

a. Parcels 19 and 20, Maryland Ave., between 6th and 7th Sts., S.W. Revised Design. Cancelled.

b. Center Town Center Park, Eye St. between 3rd and 6th Sts., S.W. Revised Design.

Mr. Stanley Sherman representing RLA attended the meeting.

Mrs. Saarinen, speaking for the members, stated that the plan was "complicated and unrelated" to the area. The concept of a meeting area was acceptable but the architect should begin again in an attempt to get a clearer or more simple design.

The Commission's disapproval was forwarded to the Redevelopment Land Agency. EXHIBIT C

3. D.C. Government, Department of Buildings and Grounds

Fort Lincoln School - Proposed Design

Mr. Lewis Fry, architect, and Mr. Gerald Purcell, of the Department of Buildings and Grounds, attended the meeting.

In reply to the members' persistent inquiry concerning design coordination, specifically the one who developed the initial scheme which had a definite design intent, Mr. Purcell's answers disclosed all coordination previously undertaken had been of an administrative type rather than architectural. Mr. Fry stated that he had assumed that architectural review was a part of the coordination process exercised by the RLA. He hoped that they would be available for future development of the project.

In explaining his design, Mr. Fry noted that he had "basically kept the same concept from the original" plan. He discussed in detail the relationship of the plan to the new community and site. The flexible design reflected the changing educational ideas and concepts and could be adapted to future programs of widely varying natures.

Throughout the discussion the members repeatedly stressed that a design coordinator or architectural consultant should be commissioned to bring unity to the total project. Certain architectural disciplines should be established which would "allow enough freedom for each architect to enrich the community." They concluded the interview with Fry by recommending that a model be developed showing the school in relation to other projects for the area as conceived in the original plan.

After Mr. Fry and Mr. Purcell left the room, the members decided that they should request that RLA "must" obtain the services of a design coordinator or a consulting firm of architects, preferably the original group, to coordinate all plans for the new town. The transcripts are submitted for the records. EXHIBIT H.

The Commission's request was forwarded to the Redevelopment Land Agency. EXHIBIT I.

4. D.C. Government, Department of Economic Development

S.L. 69-45, 1400 22nd St., N.W. - Proposed Office Building - Revised Design. Cancelled.

5. Composition of the Mall (Added)

Mr. Roche introduced the subject by remarking on the blue plastic tent, supposedly a temporary theater, and a seaplane exhibit (the NC4) under construction on the open area of the Mall. A carousel had also

been added several summers ago under the trees near the Smithsonian. Since the area seemed to be "getting awfully junky" he wondered if the Commission's authority didn't extend to what could be placed on the Mall.

The Commission's jurisdiction does include projects on the Mall but the tent and the airplane had not been submitted to the Commission, the Secretary stated. The members authorized the Chairman to inform Mr. Ripley, Secretary of the Smithsonian Institution, either personally or in writing, that the beauty of the Mall was being impaired and that the Commission of Fine Arts should have been consulted.

The meeting adjourned at 12:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Charles H. Atherton

Charles H. Atherton, Secretary

2 June 1969

Dear Mr. Hartzog:

This is just to let you know that the Commission has approved the adjusted lighting settings on the Lincoln Memorial. The Commission feels that the subdued lighting on the east elevations greatly enhances the view of the Lincoln Statue.

The Commission has two further suggestions that they would like to see explored. One, would it be possible to provide some type of baffle on the soffit lights behind the columns without affecting the illumination of the walls? The lamps are quite visible especially at the corners and detract somewhat from the overall appearance. The other suggestion is providing some wash of light across the steps leading to the Memorial. We feel it will enhance the design. It will, however, require careful study due to the possibility of shadows created by visitors walking up the steps which could prove to be undesirable. We at least hope that the idea can be explored.

Sincerely yours,

William Walton
Chairman

Mr. George B. Hartzog, Jr.
Director
National Park Service
Washington, D.C.

EXHIBIT A

14 May 1969

Dear Mr. Jordan:

This is merely to confirm Mr. Walton's telephone call to you on April 23rd, telling you of the Commission's approval of Mr. Pei's revised design for the Robert F. Kennedy grave site.

The Commission would like to see details of the design from time to time as they are developed by the architect.

By direction of the Chairman:

Sincerely yours,

Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. Robert E. Jordan III
General Counsel
Department of the Army
The Pentagon
Washington, D.C. 20310

EXHIBIT B

9 May 1969

Dear Mr. Sherman:

This is just to confirm the Commission's action regarding projects considered at the April meeting.

Revised designs for the L'Enfant Plaza East Office and Hotel Building were approved, as was the design for the office building on Parcels 19 and 20. The design for the Town Center Park at 4th and Eye Streets, S.W. is still unsatisfactory. I have sent copies of the Drawings to Mr. Sasaki and have asked him to send his comments so that we can get them to the architect in time for the June meeting on Thursday, the 19th.

I am also enclosing a copy of the discussions on the elementary school at Fort Lincoln. We will be writing to you and Arnold Maps about this project later.

Sincerely yours,

Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. Stanley Sherman
D.C. Redevelopment Land Agency
1420 New York Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C.

EXHIBIT C

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON SHIPSTEAD-LUCE ACT APPLICATIONS 4/23/69

NO SL 69-	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
44	2128 Cathedral Ave., NW James Clay Ridgway	Single family brick veneer townhouse - brick sample.
ACTION:	App'd. for brick per sample subm'd., 4/9/69.	
46	1420 F St., NW Hotel Washington	1 s-f, 12 sq-ft sign on new awning to read "The Two Continents" & the address - 1420. Red & white ltrs.
ACTION:	App'd., 4/18/69.	
45	1400-22nd St., NW Donohoe Constr. Co., Inc.	Office bldg. & parking structure.
ACTION:	App'd. as a revised prel. design. Request subm. of detailed working drawings before issuance of permit. Also request opportunity to inspect material samples at the same time, 4/23/69.	
48	L'Enfant Plaza East, SW L'Enfant Plaza Corp.	Constr. 12-story off. & hotel bldg.
ACTION:	Appd. as a revised prel. design. Request subm. of detailed working drawings before issuance of permit. Also request opportunity to inspect material samples at the same time, 4/23/69.	

EXHIBIT D

APPENDIX 1

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON OLD GEORGETOWN ACT APPLICATIONS 4/23/69

NO OG 69-	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
129	3800 Reser. Rd., NW Georgetown U.	Raise approx. 8' from prev. app'd plans, Heating & Cooling Plant
ACTION:	Recom'd. See OG 69-91, 4/16/69.	
137	3273 M St., NW John Dashtara (Rugs)	Install 1 s-f sign. Back-lighted ltrs., white tubing.
ACTION:	Not recom'd. Recom. individual ltrs. pin mounted, or painted directly on fascia over showwindow & entranceway. Request subm. of revised design, 4/23/69.	
138	2909 M St., NW Mizani Oriental Rugs	14½' X 1½' Sign. Hand-painted, black ltrs. on white bckgd.
ACTION:	Recom'd. as revised, 4/18/69.	
139	3146 Dumbarton Ave., NW Dumbarton Pharmacy	1 s-f, 6 sq-ft sign. Plywood. Brown ltrs. on white bckgd.
ACTION:	Recom'd., 4/18/69.	
140	3130 M St., NW La Casa Italiana Restaurant	1 s-f, 15 sq-ft sign. Plywood. Red, white & green.
ACTION:	Recom'd., as revised, 4/18/69.	
141	1735-32nd St., NW Dumbarton Oaks	Addns. to Director's Residence.
ACTION:	Not recom'd. Suggest west addn. at laundry rm. be similar in character to addn. on east side, especially in relation to eave, 4/18/69.	

APPENDIX 2

NO OG 69-	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
142	1226 Wisc. Ave., NW Walter Reade Org., Inc.	1 s-f, 10 sq-ft sign. Metal ltrs. No neon illumination.
ACTION:	Recom'd., 4/18/69.	
143	2529 P St., NW S. T. Chichester, Jr.	Add 3rd fl. & deck. Add 2nd fl. balcony & enlarge d-h window to French Doors. Change 1st fl. showwindow & doors. Rearrange interior to 5 apts.
ACTION:	Recom'd. for prel. design. Request subm. of detailed working drawings prior to issuance of permit. Also request subm. of material sample, 4/18/69.	
144	3007 Cambridge Pl., NW Mr & Mrs Philip Huber	Constr. ret. walls & 7' wood fence. Rear of house.
ACTION:	Recom'd., 4/18/69.	
145	3028 R St., NW Mr & Mrs Wm. M. Roberts	wrought-iron railing.
ACTION:	Recom'd., 4/18/69.	
146	1219-35th St., NW Alvin B. Harper, Jr.	62½" high stockade fence to connect to exist. front & exist. side fences. This is continuation of exist. stockade fence.
ACTION:	Recom'd., 4/18/69.	
147	1805 Wisc. Ave., NW Gen. Elec. Servicenter	1 s-f, 14 sq-ft sign.
ACTION:	Suggest slightly wider spacing & larger ltrs. on Gen. Elec. sign, 4/18/69, otherwise no objection.	

NO OG 69-	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
148	1805 Wisc. Ave., NW Gen. Elec. Servicenter	1 s-f, 2.25 sq-ft sign.
ACTION:	No obj., 4/18/69.	
149	1232-28th St., NW Richard Cassidy	Air-cond. unit on roof to set on 3" steel beams. Install duct work in attic. 24 gauge metal insul.
ACTION:	Ret'd. for add'l. inf. Request plans showing all exterior work on roof, 4/18/69.	

REPORT OF ACTIONS TAKEN ON OLD GEORGETOWN ACT APPLICATIONS

APR 10 1969

NO OG 69	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
126	3028 R St., NW Mr & Mrs Wm. M. Roberts	Remove window & erect door - provide areaway w/conc. steps.
ACTION: No obj. Request details of metal railing, 3/26/69.		
127	3344 M St., NW Rob't. A. Phillips Trust	Replace windows & door.
ACTION: Not recom'd. Character of proposed remodelling unsuitable. Recom. restudy, 3/27/69.		
128	1226 Wisc. Ave., NW Marriott Corp. (Snack Shop)	Changes in window & door openings. Roof air-cond. unit.
ACTION: Ret'd. for further study of air-cond. unit. Suggest relocating roof structure further back from wall in order to minimize appearance, also, brick-in exist. louvered opening on Prospect St. elevation, 3/27/69.		
132	3024 Cambridge Pl., NW Mr & Mrs W. J. Cox	Stucco on concrete block addn. to exist. victorian row house with contiguous wood fencing.
ACTION: Recom'd., 3/26/69.		
133	3108 "O" St., NW Christ Church	Erect exterior light over pair of doors to hallway from courtyard of St. Jude.
ACTION: Ret'd. for add'l. inf. Request drawing showing location of lamp in relation to entranceway. Also suggest glazing in lamp be other than clear glass, 3/27/69.		
134	1323-30th St., NW Mr & Mrs J. V. Mladek	Remove 3rd fl. porch. Rebuild 2nd fl. porch in brick. Constr. roof terrace.
ACTION: No obj., provided that stair balusters be set back at least 2 or 3" from nosing of step, 3/27/69.		

NO OG 69-	ADDRESS AND OWNER	PROJECT
135	1226 Wisc. Ave., NW Walter Reade Org., Inc.	1 s-f, 10 sq-ft sign. Black or brown letters. Illuminated.

ACTION: Not recom'd. Character of lettering unacceptable. Suggest a more refined style with classical lettering. Also request subm. of section drawing showing method of mounting ltrs. on fascia, & method of illumination, 3/27/69.

136	2529 P St., NW Sidnor Tebbs Chichester	Revised drawings for informal review.

ACTION: Suggest further study of scheme showing simple full-height fenestration on 1st fl. Request accurate elevation drawings with next subm., 3/27/69.

91ST CONGRESS
1ST SESSION

H. J. RES. 599

IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

MARCH 25, 1969

Mr. ROYBAL introduced the following joint resolution; which was referred to the Committee on House Administration

JOINT RESOLUTION

To provide for the establishment of a fitting memorial in the Nation's Capital to the American space program and to the brave and dedicated individuals who carry it forward.

Whereas the Congress of the United States in enacting the National Aeronautics and Space Act of 1958, and in subsequent legislative and appropriation Acts, has created and maintained a framework within which the highly successful American space program has been developed;

Whereas the American space program has been unselfishly dedicated to peaceful exploration of space for the benefit of all mankind;

Whereas the full strength of America's political, industrial,

EXHIBIT E

and technological capacity has been teamed to create and carry out that space program;

Whereas, through the intelligence, the dedication, the bravery, and the self-sacrifice of its astronauts, Americans have flown farther, longer, and deeper into space than was considered feasible a short time ago;

Whereas the Apollo program has opened up an entirely new era in space exploration; and

Whereas the Congress and the American people in the moment of triumph over the recent accomplishments of the Apollo program have not forgotten the brave astronauts who have given their lives in the fullest measure of man's dedication to the peaceful exploration of space: Now, therefore, be it

Resolved by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled, That (a) the Secretary of the Interior shall set aside land under the jurisdiction of the Department of the Interior and located in the District of Columbia for the erection of a memorial to honor the American space program and the astronauts and other individuals who have contributed or who hereafter contribute to such program.

(b) After obtaining approval for the site and design of such memorial from the National Capital Planning Commission and the Commission of Fine Arts, the Secretary of the Interior shall erect such memorial.

(c) The memorial erected under the authority of this joint resolution, and the site on which it is erected, shall be a national monument.

SEC. 2. There are authorized to be appropriated from time to time such sums of money as may be necessary to carry out the purposes of this joint resolution.

91ST CONGRESS
1ST SESSION

H. J. RES. 599

JOINT RESOLUTION

To provide for the establishment of a fitting memorial in the Nation's Capital to the American space program and to the brave and dedicated individuals who carry it forward.

By Mr. ROYBAL

MARCH 25, 1969
Referred to the Committee on House Administration